## UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS HOUSTON DIVISION

In re Cobalt International Energy, Inc. Securities Litigation

Lead Case No. 4:14-cv-03428

**CLASS ACTION** 

THE CARLYLE GROUP L.P.'S JOINDER IN THE REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW OF THE GOLDMAN SACHS GROUP, INC., RIVERSTONE HOLDINGS LLC, FIRST RESERVE, AND KERN PARTNERS LTD.

The Carlyle Group L.P. ("Carlyle") joins the arguments made by defendants The Goldman Sachs Group, Inc., Riverstone Holdings LLC, First Reserve, and KERN Partners Ltd. (the "Sponsor Defendants") in their reply memorandum of law. Those arguments are dispositive as to all defendants sued under Section 15. Plaintiffs cannot seek to state a control person claim against Carlyle or any of the other private equity sponsors by lumping them together. See Sponsors' Reply 2; Sponsors' Opening Mem. 13–14. It is therefore telling that Plaintiffs relegate any specific discussion of Carlyle to a footnote. Pls.' Opp. to Sponsors 13 n.16. As Carlyle noted in its original joinder, the claim against Carlyle fails for the additional reason that Carlyle did not even appoint a single employee as a director of Cobalt. Plaintiffs' chief response is that Carlyle and Riverstone were entitled to appoint board members jointly, although only Riverstone executives were appointed. *Id.* But the mere unexercised right to appoint a director much less a shared one—contributes nothing to the involvement in company operations necessary to support a Section 15 claim. See, e.g., Sponsors' Reply 2–3.

For the reasons stated in the Sponsor Defendants' Motion and their reply memorandum as well as the reasons above, Count IV should be dismissed against Carlyle.

Dated: September 29, 2015 Respectfully submitted,

## WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP

By: /s/ Robert A. Van Kirk
Robert A. Van Kirk
Federal I.D. No. 386734
Attorney-In-Charge
George A. Borden
Federal I.D. No. 354026
John S. Williams
Federal I.D. No. 2543133
725 Twelfth Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20005
Telephone: (202) 434-5000
Facsimile: (202) 434-5029
rvankirk@wc.com
gborden@wc.com
jwilliams@wc.com

Counsel for Defendant The Carlyle Group L.P.

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on the 29th day of September, 2015, I caused to be served a true and correct copy of the foregoing to all known counsel of record via the Court's electronic filing system.

## /s/ Robert Van Kirk

Robert Van Kirk Federal I.D. No. 386734 WILLIAMS & CONNOLLY LLP 725 Twelfth Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20005 Telephone: (202) 434-5000 Facsimile: (202) 434-5029

rvankirk@wc.com